EXPLORING TEXT-IMAGE RELATIONS IN ENGLISH COMICS FOR CHILDREN: THE CASE OF “LITTLE RED RIDING HOOD”

Ton Nu My Nhat, Nguyen Thi Mi Pha

Department of Foreign Languages, Quy Nhon University
170 An Duong Vuong, Quy Nhon, Binh Dinh, Vietnam

Received 19 December 2018
Revised 16 May 2019; Accepted 26 May 2019

Abstract: The present panorama of communication features the co-employment of language and other semiotic resources. This paper addresses this fledging field, multimodal discourse analysis, by investigating a genre targeted at children. Specifically, it studies how meanings in comics for children are constructed both verbally and visually. The data for the study is one comic - Little Red Riding Hood, which is presented via colored images and verbal texts in English. The analysis was based on Unsworth’s (2006) framework to explore the interplay of the two semiotics in the construction of the ideational contents. The results reveal that this comic displays both Expansion and Projection relations with nearly equal occurrence frequencies; however, within each type, the subtypes are vastly different with Verbal being the most predominant, which can be deemed as one of the typical features of the genre in focus. Regarding Expansion, Concurrence and Complementarity have nearly the same high percentage while Enhancement has a lower proportion. Theoretically, the findings concerning a complete full-length comic contribute to the literature on multimodal texts for young learners. The findings also have practical implications for the teaching and learning of English as a foreign language as to how to exploit the free online kid-targeted multimodal resources to engage the young learners in literary works in general and to develop their English proficiency in particular.

Keywords: systemic functional linguistics, multimodal discourse analysis, inter-semiosis, text-image relations, comics

1. Introduction

The idea of multimodality can be traced back as early as the 4th century B.C. when classical rhetoricians emphasized the potential effects of voice, gesture, and expression in the art of public speaking. However, it was not until the publications of O’Toole (1994) and Kress & van Leeuwen (1996) that the term ‘Multimodal discourse’ became technically established and this field has increasingly attracted research. The subjects of research are various, ranging from academic discourse such as mathematical discourse (O’Halloran, 2004; Nhat, 2017b), or textbooks (Salbego, Hberle, & Balen, 2015; Silva, 2016; Unsworth & Ngo, 2014, 2015), to discourse for entertainment purposes such as music videos (Brady, 2015), graphic novels (Rajendra, 2015), or advertisings (Hien, 2015; Na, 2015), to name just a few. Of particular pertinence to this line of investigation are the picture books, especially those for children (Nhat, 2017a; Tien, 2016; Unsworth, 2014; Wu, 2014). Painter, Martin & Unsworth (2013) claim:

Children’s picture books can be recognized as a key means of apprenticeship into literacy, literature and social values, which in turn means that how they are constructed to
accomplish these ends is an important educational question. Since most of the space in picture books is given over to the pictures, it is reasonable to suppose that the visual component of the books, quite as much as the verbal, is crucial in this apprenticeship. (p. 1).

This study focuses on a novel genre, namely comics for children. The research question is: How are the two semiotic resources – verbal text and images – co-deployed in a comic to impart meanings to young readers? This choice is both theoretically and practically motivated. Theoretically, the analysis will provide empirical findings in this relatively new area of investigation, and to our best knowledge, no study in the same direction on the same or similar data has been reported up to now. The practical significance of the analysis lies with the long-standing values of comics as a source of entertainment and morals to children. In addition, the widespread technological advances necessitate research into online resources, which may serve as free sources for children, especially those in under-resourced social and educational backgrounds. In this paper, an overview of the literature closely relevant to this present study will be presented - Unsworth’s (2006) framework on image-language relations and the genre of comic. The research methodology will then follow to delineate the data and the analysis of data. Then, the major findings will be presented and discussed. The paper will be concluded with the implications for the teaching of English as a foreign language to young learners and for further studies.

2. Theoretical background

The ‘Grammar of Visual Design’ developed by Kress and van Leeuwen (1996) accounts for the independent contributions of language and image to the meaning of multi-semiotic texts. More recent research has been concerned with the interactive role of image and verbiage in the construction of meaning in school science materials (Kress, 1997; Lemke, 1998; Martinec & Salway, 2005; Roth et al., 2005; Unsworth, 2004, 2006). Both Kress (1997) and Lemke (1998) focus on the “functional specialization” principle in relation to the role of images and verbiage in science texts, and they have not explicated an inter-semiotic framework of image and text. The illustrations for their descriptions are also limited. Kress’s (1997) discursive account deals with a page of a textbook on electronics and Lemke (1998) provides a discussion of the meaning-making resources of a scientific article. Another related work is the analysis of the Brazilian school science textbooks by Roth and colleagues (Roth et al., 2005). In this study, some discussion seems to be more interpersonally than ideationally oriented and they are concerned with the relationship of the caption to the main text rather than the image-text relations. Martinec and Salway (2005) specify a system of logico-semantic relations between images and text with a focus on advertisements and online news sites and galleries.

Drawing on the related works, Unsworth (2006) represents a comprehensive account of the interaction of language and images in school science materials in the form of books and websites. Like Martinec and Salway (2005), he has derived the framework from Halliday’s (1994) account of logico-semantic relations. The description is confined to the construction of ideational meaning and is summarized in the network shown in Figure 1.

Within EXPANSION, there are concurrence, complementarity; and enhancement. Concurrence refers to ideational equivalence between image and text. This image-text
Concurrence is described more delicately in terms of four subcategories: **Clarification** is synonymous to ‘viz’, ‘to be precise’ as the image clarifies or explains the text. **Exposition** refers to the concurrence or equivalence of the meanings represented in the alternative modes. **Exposition** emphasizes meanings in the different modes. **Exemplification** obtains when either the image or the text is more general. In **exemplification** the image may be an example of the content in the text or the text may include an example of what is depicted in the image. **Homospatiality** might be thought of as word-pictures where two different semiotic modes co-occur in one spatially bonded homogenous entity. One example shows an image of a campfire with the heat arising from the fire visually appears in curved lines, representing the word ‘hot’ (Figure 2).

Figure 1: Framework of image-language relations in the construction of experiential meaning (Source: Unsworth, 2006, p. 1175)

Figure 2: Homospatiality: ‘hot’
(Source: Unsworth, 2006, p. 1184)

Ideational complementarity refers to the situations where “what is represented in images and what is represented in language may be different but complementary, and joint contributors to an overall meaning that is more than the meanings conveyed by the separate modes.” (Unsworth, ibid., p. 1185). Complementarity includes augmentation and divergence. Augmentation refers to cases where each mode provides meanings ‘additional to and consistent with’ those provided in the other mode. In other words, Augmentation involves an image adding new meanings to those conveyed by the text or the text extending ideational content represented in the image. Divergence refers to the instances where the ideational contents of text and image are at variance. Unsworth notes that ideational divergence is clearly important in children’s literary picture books and school science materials.
Unsworth (ibid.) identifies enhancement relations of place, time, condition, manner and cause between images and verbiage. For instance, in Figure 3, the image of the merry-go-round is an illustration of what readers might see if they ‘look around’. That is, the verbiage constructs the condition and the image the consequence.

Projection refers to either a ‘locution’, which represents the quoting or reporting of wording, or an idea, which represents the quoting or reporting of thought. Whereas the former is referred to as Verbal, the latter, Mental. The speech or thought bubbles in cartoons are the typical realizations of these categories. Regarding the Mental relation, Figure 4 is provided to illustrate what can be regarded as a form of perception. As explicated by Unsworth, the image with the labels ‘A’, ‘B’ and ‘C’ depicts what can be seen when the onion peel is observed through a microscope.

3. Methodology

This exploration is primarily a descriptive research to yield an account of the image-text relations in the comic analyzed. To address the research question, we employed both the qualitative and quantitative methods. The qualitative method was first used to identify the types of text-image relation in the comic; then, the data was quantitatively analyzed to arrive at the occurrence frequency of these correlations between the two modes.

3.1 Data description

The comic which serves as the data for this study is Little Red Riding Hood, downloaded from Learn English – Read Comic Online. This website is aimed to provide free access to classical, popular literature written in English to young readers. It is an online version of the Classics Illustrated Junior. This comic book series was originally published by Famous Authors, Ltd (The Gilberton Company, Inc.); it consists of seventy-seven fairy and folk tale, myth and legend adaptations of literary classics such as Aladdin and His Lamp, Snow White, Beauty and the Beast, Cinderella, Goldilocks and the Three Bears, The Sleeping Beauty, Pinocchio, Rapunzel, etc. Classics
Illustrated Junior debuted with an adaptation of the Grimm Brothers’, Snow White and the Seven Dwarfs in 1953 and was a huge success, reaching its peak with a monthly circulation of 262,000 in 1960. The comics’ success introduced classic literature to a large audience of young people for decades.

Of seventy-seven fairy and folk tales and myths, we decided to choose Little Red Riding Hood because of its enormous popularity and the moral it imparts. An additional reason is that the verbal text features both monologues and dialogues, which enables an all-round description of the text-image relations where both expansion and projection unfold. The data is well in line with the concept comic.

Although phrased slightly differently, a comic is always defined as comprising two modes – text and images. According to McCloud (1993, p. 9), comics are “juxtaposed pictorial and other images in deliberate sequence, intended to convey information and/or to produce an aesthetic response in the viewer”.

As defined by Mey (1994), a comic (also known as comic strip(s)) “is a narrative form which combines written text in the usual sense and pictorial elements into an inseparable unity”. Groensteen (2013, p. 9) defines a comic “as a visual and narrative art, [comics] produce meaning out of images which are in a sequential relationship, and which co-exist with each other spatially, with or without text”.

Little Red Riding Hood comprises twenty-nine numbered full pages from the original printed book. Each full page may display from one to four panels (illustrated in Figure 5). By ‘panel’, we mean a unit consisting of a picture and an accompanying text (McCloud, 1993). As can be seen from the illustrations, for each panel, the pictorial element is separately framed, within which there is the accompanying text with the first letter in bold. There are eighty-six panels altogether.

![Figure 5: Samples of numbered full pages](image)

Data analysis

The unit of analysis is the panel. In this comic, each panel well corresponds to the unit of analysis proposed by Unsworth (ibid. p. 1174) as consisting of “an image and all the verbiage related to it by ideational content”. Unlike language, such units are not linear, as he puts it:

The multidimensionality of the two modalities - verbiage as 1-D on a 2-D page, image as 2-D or more on a 2-D page - allows the reader to make multiple passes between the image and its related verbiage, in a way that is probabilistically related to the sequencing of meaning by the producer. Thus, an intermodal unit of analysis consists of all the intermodal cycles that a reader can
make between an image and its related text. There may be multiple recursive ‘intermodal passes’ made between verbiage and image for a given unit of analysis - one pass for each of the simultaneous systems in the network that represents the potential intermodal relations for the unit of analysis (p. 1174).

Based on Unsworth’s network, 169 text-image relations were identified; a majority of panels present two relations. Each relation was categorized in terms of both type – Expansion or Projection, and subtypes – Concurrence, Complementary, or Enhancement, and Verbal or Mental. The types and subtypes of relation were then statistically analyzed to arrive at the picture of occurrence frequencies.

4. Findings and discussion

4.1 Findings

An in-depth analysis of 86 panels yielded 169 text-image relations. Generally, the comic displays both Expansion and Projection relations, with all of their subtypes - Concurrence, Complementarity, Enhancement, Verbal and Mental (Table 1). As can be seen from Table 1, there is no significant difference between the proportions of Expansion and Projection (50.9% vs. 49.1%); by contrast, the percentages of the subtypes within each type are vastly different. In the total of 169 relations found in the data, Verbal ranks the first, followed by Concurrence and Complementarity. Enhancement and Mental are the lowest.

Table 1: Occurrence frequencies of image-text relations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of relation</th>
<th>Expansion</th>
<th>Projection</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Concurrence</td>
<td>Complementarity</td>
<td>Enhancement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>21.3%</td>
<td>20.7%</td>
<td>8.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Regarding Projection, Verbal takes an overwhelming proportion, with 47.9%, while Mental makes up just 1.2%. The typical realization of the two, as Martinec & Salway (2005) suggest, is that locutions are enclosed in speech bubbles as in Figure 6 and ideas in thought bubbles as in Figure 7.
The huge number of verbal relations features the comic, enabling the dialogues between the characters throughout the story.

As for Expansion relations, Concurrence and Complementarity are far more prevalent than Enhancement. This suggests that the two modes are complement and joint contributors to the overall meaning of this comic. In terms of Concurrence, Exposition relation ranks the first with 16%; Clarification comes next at 4.7%; Exemplification is the lowest with 0.6%; and none is accounted for Homospatiality. This means that in order to reinforce the contents, the visual and verbal components are simultaneously utilized to restate or reformulate meanings rather than to exemplify, clarify or explain meanings.

Figures 8 and 9 may serve as illustrations for Expansion relation in the data. The text in Figure 8 reads “One day, she decided to sew her granddaughter a red riding hood”. The image displays an old lady sitting on the chair sewing a red cloth, which can be understood that she is sewing a red riding hood. The process depicted in the image is the same as that mentioned in the caption text. The relation depicted in Figure 9 is Clarification, where the image clarifies the verbal text. The verbiage in this figure reads: “And someone was very happy to see her, although it wasn’t grandma”. What we can see from the image is the wolf peeping at Little Red Riding Hood through the curtain and whispering happily “Aha! Here she comes.” Without the image, in this case, the reader cannot know that “someone” refers to the wolf and “her” refers to Little Red Riding Hood.

In addition to being simultaneously used to reinforce meanings, each mode is also alternatively manipulated to provide additional meanings to what is represented in the other mode. This is achieved through Complementarity, the subtypes of which, Augmentation and Divergence, however, have different proportions, with 16% and 4.7% respectively. The instances of image extending text are more frequent than those of text extending image, unfolding the facilitating role of images in this genre – to make it easy for children to understand the content of the comic. Examples of each case are discussed below for further explanation.

In Figure 10, the information of the wolf and Little Red Riding Hood walking down the path is not only provided in the text but also in the image. Besides, the rest of the text provides more information - the wolf’s wondering of how he could beat Little Red Riding Hood to grandma’s house and his idea for doing this. Figure 11 is an illustration of image extending the text. What is depicted here is not only the grandma’s opening the door but also the wolf’s using Little Red Riding Hood to avoid being defeated by the woodsman.
Finally, the findings provide the evidence that the texts and the images in the comic analyzed also complement each other through *Enhancement*, where one mode provides meanings to expand the other circumstantially. Four subtypes of *Enhancement*, namely *causal*, *temporal*, *spatial* and *condition* are found. The number of *temporal* and *causal* relations are nearly the same (3.6% and 3% respectively); *Spatial* and *condition* relations make up only a small proportion (1.8% and 0.6% respectively). Take Figures 9 and 10 for example. In Figure 12, the image just depicts the action of the wolf putting grandma into the closet, down onto the chair; still, the readers can decode when that action happens by referring to the temporal circumstance “a few minutes later” in the accompanying text. Therefore, in this panel, the text enhances the image in terms of time. Similarly, Figure 13 illustrates an instance of causal enhancement. The verbiage reads “you’re not escaping so easily, my dear” and the image depicts the wolf locking the door, which can be interpreted as the reason why Little Red Riding Hood is not going to escape easily.

4.2 Discussion

Comics play a vital role in children’s lives thanks to their educational and spiritual values. Their captivating values are imparted via both the images and the accompanying verbal texts. This study is to explore the manipulation of these two semiotics in the construction of the ideational content of the popular classic *Little Red Riding Hood*. The results disclose some noticeable findings, revealing an insightful picture of this comic, typically designed for young readers. Firstly, there is no significant difference in the occurrence frequency between the two general categories of relation - *Expansion* and *Projection* - in the comic analyzed. Secondly, regarding the subtypes of *Projection*, there is the predominance of *Verbal* relation over *Mental*. 
In order to captivate the children’s attraction and facilitate their understanding, the images and the verbal texts are co-contextualized in skillful ways. The images are purposefully employed to work in tandem with the verbal texts, rather than merely to exuberantly illustrate the verbiage. The visual clues assist and increase the amount of comprehension. The re-expression of meanings alternates with the extension of meanings throughout the story. Besides, approximately half of the inter-semiotic relations identified lie with Verbal. The large proportion of this kind can result from the belief that to children of a very young age, texts seem not to be as captivating as images; therefore, presenting utterances in the speech bubbles can enhance more effectiveness on children than embodying them in the narrative blocks. Moreover, the substantial proportion of Verbal relations enables the dialogues between the participants throughout the story to be conveyed in an easy way for young children to appreciate the literary work. Thus, this can be counted as a typical feature of this comic. The comic convention of speech balloons, as well as the facial expressions in the images, provides opportunities for young readers to better understand the spoken language and identify the mood of the characters depicted.

The findings of this study are contradictory to those of another closely-related study, which is also concerned with discourse for children. In Tien’s (2016) study on 100 English nursery rhythms in the widely-circulated Mother Goose, the finding shows that Concurrence and Complementarity are overwhelmingly deployed, leaving Projection as well as all the other subtypes marginally significant. The difference is significant, reinforcing the fact that whether or not a type of text-image correlation is employed, or to what extent each is employed, is educationally and recreationally motivated. Because Mother Goose is aimed to instill very short literary lines in young children, thereby first drawing them to the wonders of the verbal world, the images and the texts are predominantly co-employed to construct the same ideational contents. In the meantime, in the comic analyzed, both the general categories of relation tend to be equally employed to impart meanings. It is through both enhancement and projection that the story unfolds, engaging the young readers’ interest, facilitating their comprehension, and developing their language proficiency.

A key impetus for this study lies with the potential pedagogical benefits of comics as one way to compensate for the low frequency of exposure to light reading in formal teaching English as a foreign language in many under-resourced contexts in Vietnamese. Though the practice of multimodality in the classrooms in Vietnam seems to be preoccupied with other mediums such as video, films, and web pages, these free accessible resources as comics seem to elude many Vietnamese educators. It is our view that given such a wide range available, this genre needs the recognition it truly deserves. Then, an understanding of the role of images and texts in contributing meanings to develop the contents on the part of the teacher, tutor, or parent can help maximize the full potential of this genre to facilitate the children’s first steps on their road to reading literary works in English. The popularity of comics among children supports this medium to be used as pedagogical materials to stimulate a love for reading literature texts in English in a non-threatening way. With a powerful blend of text and image, graphic literary works are certainly highly stimulating, beneficial and thought provoking (Rajendra, 2015). From the perspective of Howard Gardner’s multiple intelligences theory, comics are beneficial to students with varied strengths. Whereas the verbal components are an obvious advantage for students with linguistic intelligence, the
vibrant images in these works may enhance spatial intelligence. These engaging classics can serve as tools of tremendous benefits to those who are strong in interpersonal intelligence when acted out or role-played through proper instructional strategies. With careful planning, the development of vocabulary, grammatical and communicative competences can also be boosted. The comic versions of these stories can also serve a stepping stone to the original versions, to more comics and graphic novels as well as non-fictional genres.

5. Conclusions

Unsworth (2006, p. 1165) states that “today both language and images are integral to the texts we use. As well as making meanings separately, language and images combine to make meanings in new ways in contemporary texts”. Sharing the same idea, Moore & Dwyer (1994) emphasize that the combination of visuals and language makes communication more effective than words alone. To contribute to this fledging field of study, this study explores the interaction of these two semiotics in constructing the ideational meanings in a genre typically for young children. The data is a complete full-length comic, an adaptation from the popular classic Little Red Riding Hood. Unsworth’s (2006) framework of image-language relations was applied to depict the picture of the correlations between texts and images in this sample. The findings reveal that in this comic the two semiotics support each other in different ways to attractively contribute to the contents of the story, which would prove to be much less captivating in the absence of either mode, given the targeted readers. Attention needs to be paid to the contribution of both semiotics to the construction of contents to gain a full understanding of how the story unfolds.

Given the increasing advances of multimedia and growing role of English as a lingua franca, the significance of the findings is apparent. An understanding of the role of the other meaning-making resources other than language as well as their co-relations will certainly benefit anyone interested in making best use of the similar online resources to imbue a love for light reading in children and to develop young learners’ English proficiency. Nowadays, kids can be immersed in English easily anywhere anytime by watching cartoons, listening to music in English or taking online English courses, etc.; of these, comics in English, especially when they are simplified from popular classics like those on Classics Illustrated Junior, prove to be potentially worthwhile. Reading English comics is considered a great way for kids to get interested in and excited about learning English. Inge (1990, p. 17) emphasizes that “[t]he comics, however, not only serve to introduce the child to reading and give him his first taste of independent comprehension; they have also enriched the English language in innumerable ways through popular phrases, word coinages, and the revival of archaic usages.”. The use of comics as supplementary resources in the teaching of English as a foreign language has long been established. Comics complement reading through their rich illustrations. Given the open accessibility of these comics for children on the Internet, they can be harnessed to have young learners of English expose to the target language in an engaging way.

There are obvious limitations in this study. The most apparent limitation of this study is the size of the data, which involves only one comic. We hope that further research in the same lines will be conducted with a larger corpus to see whether or not the findings reported in this study can be generalized to the whole genre in focus, particularly the online resources. A similar closely-related fruitful
area to investigate is the interplay of the text and image in the short comics which are mostly limited to one or two pages in the coursebooks of English as a foreign language and how to make them most effective to the development of the learners’ English proficiency. Another limitation in methodological design lies with the identification of the relations, which is consistently based on Unsworth’s framework. As noted by Unsworth, this ‘initial tentative network of ideational meanings in image-verbiage relations is likely to require further development.’ (Unsworth, ibid., p.1200). A combination of some related systems of text-image relations could have yielded a more detailed and diverse account of the relations underlying the comic analyzed. Finally, the last decades have seen the increasingly prominent role of images in not only fiction but also non-fiction materials for children in the pre-teenage years. Children are readily surrounded with a diversely multimodal environment. We hope that this preliminary study may serve as a stepping stone to further studies on the practical implications of multimodal discourse within the Vietnamese educational context.

Acknowledgements

We would also like to extend our gratitude to the anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments which led to the current version of this article.

References


KHẢO SÁT QUAN HỆ HAI PHƯƠNG TIỆN HÌNH ẢNH VÀ NGÔN NGỮ TRONG TRUYỆN TRANG TIẾNG ANH DÀNH CHO THIẾU NHI: TRƯỜNG HỢP “CÔ BÉ QUÀNG KHĂN ĐỎ”

Tôn Nữ Mỹ Nhật, Nguyễn Thị Mi Pha

Khoa Ngoại ngữ, Trường Đại học Quy Nhơn
170 An Dương Vương, Quy Nhơn, Bình Định, Việt Nam


Từ khóa: Ngôn ngữ học chức năng hệ thống, truyện tranh, phân tích diễn ngôn đa thức; quan hệ giữa hình ảnh và ngôn từ, quan hệ giữa các phương thức